

Town of Barnstable
Old King's Highway Historic District
MINUTES
Wednesday, October 24, 2012
6:30pm

To all persons deemed interested or affected by the Town of Barnstable's Old King's Highway Historic District Act under Section 9 of Chapter 470, Acts of 1973 as amended. You are hereby notified that a hearing was held at the West Barnstable Community Building, 2377 Meetinghouse Way (Route 149), West Barnstable, MA.

Committee Members Present: Carrie Bearse, George Jessop, Elizabeth Nilsson, Bill Mullin
Committee Members Absent: Mary Blair Petiet

A quorum being met, Chair Bearse called the hearing to order at 6:30pm. The Chair explained the hearing and appeal process and invited the public to address the Committee and view the plans of interest.

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

Zemke, Robert & Joan, 504 Main Street, West Barnstable, Map 133, Parcel 008

Replace Gutters

Represented by Robert & Joan Zemke

Gutters will be aluminum painted eggshell to match the trim which is painted beige. George Jessop noted that the existing gutters are turned at the corners and confirmed that the new gutters will do the same.

Motion duly made by Elizabeth Nilsson, seconded by George Jessop to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for Robert & Joan Zemke at 504 Main Street, West Barnstable as Submitted.

So Voted Unanimously

NEW APPLICATIONS

Elliott, Dana & Ledwith, Robert, 40 Keveney Lane, Barnstable, Map 351, Parcel 027

Demolish Existing 2-Car Garage

Applicant has withdrawn the Certificate of Appropriateness and Withdrawal Form signed 10/16/2012

Elliott, Dana & Ledwith, Robert, 40 Keveney Lane, Barnstable, Map 351, Parcel 027

Construct New 2-Car Garage

Applicant has withdrawn the Certificate of Appropriateness and Withdrawal Form signed 10/16/2012

Sayers, Francis & Karen, 78 Flint Rock Road, Barnstable, Map 316, Parcel 080-005

Replace Front Shingles with Clapboard

Represented by Karen Sayers and Contractor Rian Ice

The existing front façade is shingles and they would like to change to clapboard. Contractor Rian Ice asked if they would approve cement board and Carrie Bearse stated that they have not approved this material in the historic district for a residential home. Mr. Ice stated that they will proceed with cedar clapboards painted bleaker beige #HC-80. They also intend to re-roof in a charcoal color.

Motion duly made by Elizabeth Nilsson, seconded by George Jessop to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for Francis & Karen Sayers at 78 Flint Rock Road, Barnstable for re-siding as amended with cedar clapboard.

So Voted Unanimously

Ruscitto, Robert & Bette, 73 George Street, Barnstable, Map 319, Parcel 058

Construct 16' x 20' Second Floor Addition

Represented by Ken Sadler, Ken Sadler Designs

Ken Sadler explained that they were here before the Committee in 2007 to construct a partial addition and they would like to continue the addition with a second floor. Carrie Bearse confirmed that the addition will now be the same height as the original house and Ken Sadler added that they will be cleaning it up and adding a flying rake to all gables. Windows will match existing.

Motion duly made by George Jessop, seconded by Elizabeth Nilsson to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for Robert & Bette Ruscitto at 73 George Street, Barnstable as Submitted.

So Voted Unanimously

**Braman, Forest/Overseas Schools Assistance Corp, 199 Harbor Point Road, Barnstable
Map 352, Parcel 017**

Change of Exterior Paint Color – House & Garage

Represented by John Thrasher

Mr. Thrasher stated that they are changing the color on the house and garage to shaker beige. The trim will remain white. He also noted that the house is a combination of shingles and clapboards.

Motion duly made by Bill Mullin, seconded by Elizabeth Nilsson to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for Forest Braman/Overseas Schools Assistance Corp at 199 Harbor Point Road, Barnstable as Submitted.

So Voted Unanimously

Cummaquid Golf Club, 35 Marstons Lane, Barnstable, Map 350, Parcel 001

Demolish Existing Clubhouse

Represented by Attorney John Kenney, John Holmgren, Shawn Malloy & Daniel Salien

NOTE: Elizabeth Nilsson recuses herself from the discussion and vote

Chair Bearse read two letters that were received into the record. Peter Coos and Keith and Lynn Richards each wrote in opposition of the project. (Exhibits 1, 2)

Attorney Kenney noted for the record that he is representing the application, but is also a member and on the project's Building Committee. The club was founded by many prominent northsiders in 1896 and the Town has the golf course designated as a historic area. This project started over a year ago with different designs. First, they are proposing to demolish the existing clubhouse which was built in 1950 and has no unique architectural features. The club was redone in 1972 and again, no significant features were added. Members reviewed photographs of each elevation of the existing building.

Carrie Bearse asked members if they have any questions on the demolition and hearing none, asked if anyone from the public wished to speak on the application for demolition. No one from the public came forward.

Motion duly made by Bill Mullin, seconded by George Jessop to Approve the Certificate for Demolition for Cummaquid Golf Club at 35 Marstons Lane, Barnstable as Submitted.

So Voted Unanimously

Cummaquid Golf Club, 35 Marstons Lane, Barnstable, Map 350, Parcel 001

Rebuild Clubhouse, New Entranceway, Revised Parking

Represented by Attorney John Kenney, John Holmgren, Shawn Malloy & Daniel Salien

Attorney Kenney reviewed the architectural renderings for the proposed new clubhouse. The existing clubhouse has a gross floor area of 4619, the main floor 4804 for a total of 9423 square feet. On top of that there is a walk in cooler and a patio for a gross floor area of 11,238. The proposed clubhouse will have a gross floor area on the ground floor of 8001, main floor 8074 for a total of 16,075 square feet. Additionally, there will be decks, an upper patio and lower patio for a total of 21,089 square feet. A new entranceway off Marstons Lane to improve site distance is also proposed.

Mr. Holmgren spoke regarding the architectural design and noted that the proposed clubhouse is in the same general area due to the shape of the lot. In order to put it anywhere else would cause destruction of the golf course. They moved it as far back to the railroad tracks as possible and to still allow for fire trucks, etc.

Attorney Kenney added that they are going to maintain the existing access for a service lane. He also addressed questions raised by neighbors as to the reason the septic system is so large. It is because of the health code requirements that assumes all members will be there at one time using the facilities.

Carrie Bearse addressed concerns raised in two of the letters received regarding noise, which she pointed out was not within this Committee's purview, however, inquired as to the locations of the outside food service.

Attorney Kenney stated possibly on the patio, but the main area will be on the front overlooking the golf course.

Daniel Salien spoke next regarding the landscaping. His focus was on fitting the new clubhouse, its exterior features and parking lot into the lot and creating a beautiful setting with plantings and to design the outdoor rooms that extend from the clubhouse. He tried to design an attractive parking area and added the necessary screening. All along the entrance off Marstons Lane will be a 6-7 foot tall privet fence which will screen the area from day one. He has heard concerns regarding existing trees being removed and believes the club will be making changes to preserve these trees. The privet hedge will continue as you turn into the club to further screen the views. The entryway will also be planted with pairs of shade trees and those shade trees continue along the front of the clubhouse. An existing planting screen hides the cart barn and also groves of evergreens buffer the parking lot. Once you get into the entrance, there are hedges to separate the golfers from the parking facilities. Flowering trees and also some lower level flowering plants will be added. Large flower beds will be planted around the front and traditional plantings around the foundation. Hydrangeas and other blooming plants will be featured during peak seasons. On the upper terrace area there will be a retaining wall and another hedge for screening.

Shawn Malloy, architect for the project explained that the siting of the clubhouse is dictated by the elements.

They tried to be sympathetic to the style of the Cape, utilizing the strictest dimensions and with the roof itself to incorporate some tapered rooflines to gently rise out of the surroundings. Materials were chosen with the intent

of keeping with the neighborhood. Starting with the base; white cedar siding, warm white trim, windows will have no accent color, the roof is proposed for weathered wood shingles. Lastly, modest accent pieces at the chimney with a New England stone veneer and copper downspouts. On the lower level there is a modest walkway that is covered and they do not show any seating here. On the upper level there is the opportunity to take advantage of a porch that is on the private side of the club where the course is. The deck materials will be white railings with mahogany capping, ipe decking and the trim on the deck and building is proposed for azek painted white.

Carrie Bearse confirmed that those windows that do have grills will have exterior applied grills. She also asked for reference, the difference in building height with the proposed clubhouse. After a brief discussion, it was determined that the new building will be approximately 5 feet higher than the existing.

The lighting was discussed next; the poles will be 10 feet with period fixtures and LED which will be set on a timing schedule. No lights will intrude into the neighborhood.

The Chair opened the discussion for Public Comment and Joe Berlandi spoke in opposition to the project. He noted that he is a resident, a member of Cummaquid Heights Association and a member of the Golf Course. His concern as a resident is the size of the clubhouse and the setting. It is an extremely attractive building siting alone, but it is not siting alone, it is within a community and will have an impact. It is substantially twice the size of the existing building and more activities are going to happen there. He is also concerned about the entrance in that you will now see the back of the building as the front will face the golf course.

Peter Coos spoke in opposition and noted that most of his points he covered in his letter which was read at the beginning of the meeting but wanted to know that if this were to fall under the review of the Cape Cod Commission, would they have considered it first, and how much less square footage is involved to not have triggered the Cape Cod Commission's review. Attorney Kenney responded that the Cape Cod Commission would have reviewed it first and that there was approximately 100 square feet difference. If you take the covered walkways away, they are under 400 square feet. Attorney Keeney also added that they are not doubling the size and most of the increase is to cover the codes due to handicap regulations for bathrooms, hallways, etc. Mr. Coos concluded that there is nothing in the neighborhood that reflects this cottage style architecture and believes it is a drastic change to have this building looming.

Stan Baukus spoke in opposition and is very concerned about the two story building which will be visible from the street. This building is moving closer to Marstons Lane and closer to the railroad tracks. It is going to be 8-10 times the size of any home in the neighborhood so the visual impact will be tremendous on anyone traveling to and from the area and for those that live there permanently. Traffic will increase and trash and deliveries will increase. This building will forever change their quiet residential neighborhood.

Gerry Coughlin spoke in opposition as a concerned resident and member as well. Average homes are approximately 2,000 square feet. There are no trophy homes and he believes they do not need a trophy country club. This will be detrimental to the residential homes and he requests that the project be scaled down. He submitted a copy of his letter for the file. (Exhibit 3)

Lynn Richards wished to say that this little clubhouse has been pretty much a quite place and she believes the increase in size will just bring "it" into the neighborhood.

Keith Richards stated that he lives across from the maintenance building and he wishes to address the traffic and the issue that the entrance is now within the Heights. The other concern is the parking lot and he understands they have removed the auxiliary parking area. He is very happy with the plantings, but with regard to the mature trees that are close to the road, he believes those trees are important to the screening. Could the hedge be moved back closer to the parking lot and away from the road so that the existing vegetation and trees could be saved? He would also like the hedge to wrap around the lot for cars coming the other way on Marstons Lane.

Blair Perry spoke in opposition as a resident on Dromoland Lane. His property is on the back side of the golf course and although he is concerned with the size of the building, he will not see it. What he does see is the golfers and a certain percentage use the course inappropriately and believe that his back yard is part of the golf course. They come onto his property chasing golf balls and when it rains, use his back porch for shelter.

Mary Sheehan spoke last in opposition of the project. She has lived in this neighborhood for 47 years and this is a huge building. She will be able to see it from her house.

Chair Bearse closes the Public Comment period.

Attorney Kenney addressed some of the concerns raised by the public regarding noise and increased activity and increase in number of golfers. The membership is fixed within the by-laws and by the Town of Barnstable with a special permit. The building is not twice as large if you consider the outdoor areas, patios and decks. The dining room sits 20 more people than currently. No change in membership or operation is proposed. The Club does not want functions from outside members, although members could have weddings or birthday function, but there is not a lot of room for additional activities. The Clubhouse is dated and the increase is to meet new codes. It is set back from Marstons Ave and what you see now is a gravel parking lot and they propose a hedge for screening. The existing trees will be kept and he has already spoken to Management regarding deliveries and garbage pick ups and non will occur before 7:00am. They are trying to work cooperatively with neighbors.

Bill Mullin stated that if their requirement is to have a building that size, only five feet higher than the current building, he believes the building is architecturally appropriate and the other issue regarding noise and deliveries are not within this Committee's review.

George Jessop stated that he has gone over the drawings and looking at them specifically for the amount of floor space and code increase requirements. He would believe that the current building does not meet the handicap codes. He believes that bathrooms are required for both guests and employees. The building sits adjacent to the existing site and the proximity to the railroad tracks is closer. The building has round contours of the similar site and it has been fit to the existing grades to fit the topography. The existing parking lot is larger, but a privet hedge will provide screening and continue to grow taller. He does suggest that the setback of the privet hedge be set back to save as much vegetable as possible, but it is a positive element for landscaping the street. The relocation of the entrance is preferable as he has noticed the congestion of traffic at the railroad tracks. The fact that the building sits lower than the existing, means that the increased width and height is just slightly more than the current and given its size is quite a feat. The style is a period that follows the Greek revival and there is a continuation of architectural style which is appropriate for a new building.

Carrie Bearse agreed with both Bill Mullin and George Jessop in that she does not think the setting or design is excessive. She would like to address the concerns of the neighbors, albeit it is not within their purview. While empathetic to the neighbors, golf balls, noise, deliveries can be an issue; she hopes these can be mitigated over time. The applicant has made an effort to speak with abutters and hopefully, they will continue to do so. There is limited membership and she does have concerns that the whole membership is not on board and that this may all change. She would want to see the screening as indicated on the plan and the turning of the privet hedge as suggests.

Peter Coos wished to add for the record that he understands that the only time the neighbors met with the golf course was when Mr. Richards requested to do so. He believes there has been no effort to let the neighbors know what is going on. Secondly, there are very few neighbors of Cummaquid that are members.

Attorney Kenney stated that many of the speakers this evening are members and only one person reached out, Dr. Richards. Dr. & Mrs. Richards worked out one date that was agreeable to all and everyone was welcome. They were happy to meet with them. They are not trying to avoid the neighbors and are trying to work with them regarding the noise, trees, auxiliary parking and will continue to do so.

Councilor Ann Canedy asked that if the Club would make the necessary changes to keep the existing trees, would the Committee be agreeable to making that a condition of their motion. Attorney Kenney noted that they would be willing to make the changes to the landscape plan, however, they would not be able to keep every tree, especially the ones in the area of the new entrance. If they moved the hedge, they could keep most of them and they could wrap the privet hedge along the entrance to the putting green.

Blair Perry stated that Counsel for the Club suggested that the membership for the club was fixed and wished to know if they limit the use to members only. Attorney Kenney replied that members and guests are welcome.

Stan Baukus added that membership was referred to as 350 members, but there are presently 570+ people that belong as family is allowed under the membership.

Carrie Bearse would like to see a revised landscaping plan for the hedge, the hedge wrapping and removal of the auxiliary parking.

Motion duly made by Bill Mullin, seconded by George Jessop to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for Cummaquid Golf Club at 35 Marstons Lane, Barnstable, with revised landscaping

plan showing the remaining trees, hedge wrapping around to the putting area and the removal of the auxiliary parking area.

So Voted Unanimously

NOTE: Elizabeth Nilsson returns for the remainder of the Meeting

St Peter, Stanley, 3715 Main Street, Barnstable, Map 317, Parcel 081

Demolish Existing Garage

Represented by Attorney Jeni Landers

Attorney Landers described the garage as a one-story building that has been used for storage and is in disrepair. There is no historical significance, or any unique features.

Abutters Leta Fulginiti and Paul Murphy were present and are not in favor of the demolition. Attorney Landers stated that the use of the garage is by the St Peter's Family Trust. Ms. Fulginiti added that there is on-going litigation as to ownership and the garage is important to her. She purchased her property via a bank foreclosure and the garage was on her property and she disagrees that the garage is in disrepair as she has done upkeep by painting the doors and trim.

George Jessop asked if there will be a determination by the courts shortly and Attorney Landers stated that it was scheduled for the day before and rescheduled to tomorrow.

Carrie Bearse stated that although she has empathy for both parties, the structure does not have any historic significance. She suggests a continuation to the next meeting in hopes that the issue of ownership will be determined before that time.

Motion duly made George Jessop, seconded by Elizabeth Nilsson to Continue the Certificate of Appropriateness for Stanley St Peter at 3715 Main Street, Barnstable to November 14, 2012 at 6:30pm.

So Voted Unanimously

MINOR MODIFICATIONS

DeSimone, Richard, 233 Country Club Drive, Barnstable, Map 349, Parcel 040

Modify Trim over Garage Doors, Remove Windows & Modify Transom Window on Rear Elevation

Members reviewed the changes and found them to be appropriate.

Motion duly made by Bill Mullin seconded by Elizabeth Nilsson to Approve the Minor Modification for Richard DeSimone at 233 Country Club Drive, Barnstable as Submitted.

So Voted Unanimously

CERTIFICATE OF EXEMPTIONS

Keyser, Joan & Richard, 11 Doral Road, Barnstable, Map 349, Parcel 037

Construct Stone Wall – 80' x 28"

Motion duly made by Elizabeth Nilsson, seconded by Bill Mullin to Approve the Certificate of Exemption for Joan & Richard Keyser at 11 Doral Road, Barnstable as Submitted.

Longtine, Gary, 75 Maple Street, West Barnstable, Map 132, Parcel 026-001

Install 4' Fence & Gate at Entrance to Driveway

Members of the Committee had questions regarding the material of the fence and exact location. Staff will determine both and resubmit at the next meeting.

OTHER BUSINESS

Commonwealth of Mass/Cape Cod Community College, 2240 Iyannough Road, Barnstable, Map 236, Parcel 005-B00 & Map 236, Parcel 005-W00

Review Landscape Plan Received 10/18/2012

The landscape plan was reviewed with the change of rhododendron trees to be place five feet on center. There is concern that the plants may not be available for fall planting. Members were not pleased that the plantings may not occur before spring.

Having no further business before this Commission, a Motion was duly made by Bill Mullin, seconded by George Jessop to Adjoin the Meeting at 9:15pm.

So Voted Unanimously

Respectfully submitted,
Marylou Fair, Recording Secretary

Attached: Exhibits 1,2,3