

Barnstable Historical Commission
February 16, 2010

MINUTES

A JOINT PUBLIC HEARING WITH
THE OLD KING'S HIGHWAY HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMITTEE
AND
THE HYANNIS MAIN STREET WATERFRONT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Meeting called to order at 3:05pm

Members Present: Barbara Flinn, Len Gobeil, Nancy Shoemaker, Nancy Clark, George Jessop, Marilyn Fifield and Jessica Rapp Grassetti

Staff Present: Jackie Etsten, Growth Management Department
Jo Anne Miller Buntich, Director Growth Management Department

Demolition Application Filed

18 Chase Street, Hyannis (1920 - Not Inventoried)

Partial Demolition, New Dormer/Addition

Represented by Thomas Nelson

- Structure status: vinyl sided; asphalt roof; elevation front gable
- Proposing: retain gable, add dormers to accommodate bathroom, roofing

Comments

- Ridge line of dormer should be dropped down to match
- Window should match existing – 6/6 and dropped to be level with existing windows

Motion duly made by George Jessop, seconded by Nancy Shoemaker, that 18 Chase Street is not considered historically or architecturally significant and does not need to proceed to a public hearing

VOTE: So voted unanimously

Recommendations: Lower ridge line and 6/6 windows on front elevation

408 Wianno Avenue, Osterville (1822 –Inventoried)

Full Demolition of Home

Represented by Shawn Gilfoy (representing actual builder)

- Seeking to demolish building; vacant since 2003; not visible from the street but is visible from East Bay
- Access limited to tower
- No foundation exists; current support is not strong; condition is poor
- New house plans distributed
- Site visit made by Barbara Flinn; states structure in poor shape
- No structural report completed
- Owner needs to sign the application and provide authority for alternate representation
- When property was inventoried for historic purposes it was eligible for the National Register of Historic Places but was never filed

Motion duly made by Jessica Rapp-Grassetti, seconded by Nancy Clark, that the house is architecturally significant and should go to public hearing

VOTE: So voted unanimously

Discussion:

- New plans will be made available to members
- Members permitted access to walk the property

- Property needs to be secured; TOB Building Department should be notified

Public Hearing scheduled for Monday, March 8, 2010, 4:00pm

INFORMAL REVIEW

1230 Craigville Beach Road, Centerville (1900 – Not Inventoried)

Proposed Addition

Represented by Anne Mich, Designer

- Removal: small back porch with stairway
- Installing: 10'x24' addition - extension of kitchen and master bedroom, adding a 14'x16' porch with interchangeable screens and windows
- Addition will not be visible from the street
- Ridge line discussed; 2" pitch due to new wind codes
- Roof line dimensions would have been helpful – no plan available
- Structural issues questioned as it is being requested to go higher than the existing roof ridge; this issue was reviewed with the Engineer, once structural integrity was met, no further application was needed and blueprints were stamped; concerned that if plans were to change again – it would need a new review with the Engineer

Motion duly made by Nancy Shoemaker, seconded by Len Gobeil, that George Jessop and Ann get together informally and see if they can resolve the issues, show different materials, see if the pitch can be lowered, as preferred; and if George feels that the Commission's sentiments and the structural integrity have been met, that no hearing be scheduled.

Discussion

- Motion not necessary, but take the language in the motion as a recommendation with the understanding that George Jessop will return to the Commission with recommendations
- Full set of plans should be submitted
- Further process discussed

80 Wachusett Avenue, Hyannisport (1880 – NR District, Contributing – Inventoried)

Demolish/Rebuild Existing Garage, Addition(s) to House

Background provided by Jackie Etsten

- Structure listed on the National Register
- Spoke with Sarah Korjeff at the Cape Cod Commission (CCC); CCC requests BHC to try and work things out

Represented by Richard Curl, Architect

- New plans submitted
- Initial goal was to use the house as a year-round residence; structure is currently unheated and uninsulated; first step is to put in a full basement; windows will all be the same; adding towers; bump-out for a breakfast nook, and a small addition in the back
- Structure represents three architectural eras; will try to enhance the porch area back to its original state where single columns now exist and to better match the original state of the house
- Portion of the roof and the turret will change as well; eve will carry around the house
- Seeking to demolish the garage; rebuild it in another location allowing for maximum yard space.

Discussion

- Windows should be 2/1
- Applicant reminded that a change of more than 25% of the gross floor area of the building requires review by the Cape Cod Commission; also significant changes could alter the National Register listing status
- Painted elements / brackets are superfluous / aesthetic, and could be removed
- Both the engineer and builder have expressed concerns over the structural integrity; a substantial amount may need to be removed and rebuilt; should that happen, work must stop for a full application to BHC, with determination to be made regarding how much will remain and including detailed plans and percentage of what is being removed
- Continued to Monday, March 8, 2010

Barnstable Historic Commission meeting adjourned at 5:14pm

Joint Public Meeting between Barnstable Historic Boards convenes for review of the Preservation Plan update at 5:15pm

- Preservation Plan will be discussed in an open meeting again on March 1, 2010 at 6:00 PM
- Plan previously distributed to members

Presentation given by Julie Larry, Principal with TTL Architects

Other presenters include: TTL Architectural Historian Geoffrey Melhuish; Patty Kelleher from Community Opportunities Group, Inc.

Sarah Korjeff, Planner and Historic Preservation Specialist, Cape Cod Commission

Phase I: Hyannis Main Street Waterfront Historic District

- Rating system developed for existing properties: current status per National Register (NR) criteria which is architectural integrity and the level of historical significance plus a third category of age
- Architectural integrity category looks at how intact the building is; does it have its original details / existing windows / symbolism of original construction, with ratings expressed in four levels (excellent, good, fair, deteriorated)
- Historical Significance has four levels as well: National significance, State-level significance, Local Significance, or no historical significance at all (the latter level applied to buildings constructed after WWII); should a category meet multiple levels – the total is accumulative
- Age: focus is on older buildings even if they did not necessarily retain their original architecture; contribution rating is - significant, moderately significant, moderate, minor or non-contributing
- Historic building occupants (commercial) have been taken into consideration in historical significance
- Weighting of categories reviewed and discussed; standardized means of rating and categorization difficult due to size of district and the fact that each structure has its own significance, plus significance differential between national, state and local standards
- Level and type of significance noted on inventory
- 23 properties with historic age significance had been demolished since the first survey which took place in the 80's
- Slide presentation of most significant properties (photo, name, estimated date of construction, address, NR status and potential for individual NR listing, with numerical rating also included.

Geoffrey Melhuish, TTL Architects

Phase I – Part B: Growth Incentive Zone (GIZ)

- Properties within the GIZ are primarily residential, dating back to the mid 19th Century
- Slide presentation of most significant properties

Phase II (Barnstable, West Barnstable, Centerville, Hyannis and Osterville)

- Barnstable and West Barnstable previously surveyed, so minimal number of properties added
- Surveyed areas and number of properties reviewed; potential for expansion of historic districts discussed; Cotuit reviewed for expanding the district; Marstons Mills reviewed for eligibility as a historic district; several buildings eligible; local districts – more determination at the town level for design review; character of structures varies; local district recommendations; Growth Incentive Zone (GIZ) reviewed
- Prioritized street list developed for future recommendations: Barnstable Harbor; North of Commerce Road; Craigville Beach Road area; Squaw Island; and more
- Second and third priority areas and recommendations for additional inventory reviewed
- Records of inventoried properties in Osterville need to be located
- Comments or questions should be submitted to Jackie

Patty Kelleher, Community Opportunities

- Worked on the Preservation Plan component, updated from the two previous 1985 and 1990 plans
- Preservation Plan will be Volume I will include recommendations from the survey work

- Volume II will include the background information for future surveys, NR and local historic district recommendations
- Feedback on working draft requested
- Sections include: History of Barnstable and the Seven Villages; Barnstable today, reviewing each village and its historical resources, local historic districts, NR districts, scenic roads, individual properties and issues and concerns involving historical resources. encompassing residential, agricultural, commercial and government properties, cottage colonies, seaside resorts, churches and meeting halls; historic landscapes (agricultural, industrial and heritage); historic objects, structures and cemeteries; archaeological resources and current protection status; museums and village libraries; identified preservation organizations; preservation planning history in Barnstable; existing public policies, regulations and management; preservation issues, opportunities and recommendations; education and advocacy, regulatory protection for historic resources, and municipal funding status.

Discussion / Comments

- TTL commended for their completion of inventory forms
- Ranking system for determination of historical significance provides valuable data but map should be accompanied with a one-page synopsis of the structure involved and its importance and relevance
- Evaluation of architectural integrity should be included in the inventory narrative; concerns about language surrounding 'deterioration' as condition of building is, and should be a separate evaluation; TTL will make clarifications
- Request for additional narrative to accompany map itself
- Rating criteria definitions, language need to be addressed and expanded for understanding by all; category language to be reviewed; criteria heavily weighted to the age of a building, a benefit to older buildings in poorer shape
- Options for future actions
- Changing of language now prior to the submission of the plan is suggested
- Preservation restrictions offer promise, but are lengthy and frustrating despite their protective aspects
- Demolition ban on Main Street in Hyannis; beneficial to historic preservation; allows for negotiation on structural preservation as well
- Demolition by neglect a continuing challenge
- All documents posted on the Town of Barnstable website, Growth Management Department

Motion to adjourn duly made by Nancy Clark, seconded by Nancy Shoemaker.

So voted unanimously

Meeting adjourned at 5:57pm

** Further detail may be obtained by viewing the video via Channel 18 or on demand at <http://www.town.barnstable.ma.us> **

Respectfully submitted by Theresa M. Santos
Growth Management Department